

Helpdesk Report: Learning outcomes in Pakistan

Date: 10 August 2011

Query: Evidence paper on accelerating learning outcomes and literacy programmes for DFID's two country programmes in Afghanistan and Pakistan.

Enquirer: DFID UK

Content

1. Overview
2. Overview texts
3. Sector-wide analysis
4. Programme evaluations – sector-wide
5. Programme evaluations – focus on reaching excluded children
6. Additional information

1. Overview

Currently only 54% of the population aged 15 or over can read or write (66.25% male and 41.75% female). Of the youth population (15-24 years), the literacy rate (2004-8) is 79% for males and 59% for females.

Efforts to improve literacy rates have focused on improving inputs, such as, teacher qualifications and training as well as the curriculum, texts books and school conditions. Research studies have tended to focus on these inputs and have generally not considered how they and other efforts impact the learning outcomes of students.

There has been some progress in setting up systems to assess learning achievements in Pakistan- for example, the National Education Assessment System (NEAS). Results from an initial survey show that:

- Teachers' use of the blackboard during lessons significantly increased students' achievement in Urdu, mathematics, general science and social studies.
- Students who never got punished by their teachers performed significantly better.
- Teacher training appeared to have little effect on student achievement.

There is concern that focusing on exam results as the main indicator of success leads to pressure on school to use traditional rote learning teaching methods. Cheating in tests is also widespread.

Literacy programmes that have demonstrated successful outcomes and that have been either evaluated or recognised as working have the human resources, leadership and institutional support to take reforms forward. Innovative approaches, often initiated by local NGOs, include adapting the curriculum and schools hour to be more relevant to students as well as providing meals, cash stipends and working with employers and parents to encourage them to support their child's education. However, these innovative approaches have often not been

assessed in terms of whether they improve student learning. The main focus of success has been on enrolment and retention.

Positive outcomes include:

- The National Adult Literacy Programme has resulted in the establishment of about 120,263 adult literacy centres in 122 districts and as a result, about 2,555,606 adult learners (95% of whom are women) have graduated from the programme and are now able to read and write.
- The Universal Primary Education (UPE) programme has facilitated the establishment of about 21,000 community-based feeder schools (CBFSs) in 50,000 villages and trained over 21,000 community-based literacy facilitators (feeder teachers). Enrolment has increased dramatically in most areas and drop-out rates have decreased.
- Comparing learning achievements in child-friendly schools and non child-friendly schools showed that girls and boys alike had better results overall in Grade 5 public examinations (2006). Girls performed at significantly higher levels overall but boys excelled at science and maths.
- Educational Sector Reform Assistance (ESRA) training of government school teachers has led to some teachers using more student-centred learning practices. However, in most of the schools, teachers still tended to employ traditional teaching methods.
- Concentrated in Northern Pakistan and Sindh, the Aga Khan Education Service, Pakistan (AKES, P) operates 186 AKES, P schools and supports 200 community-based and some 75 government schools all over Pakistan. These enrol about 62,000 children at any one time. The exam pass rate for AKES, P students was 88% in 2005 (the general pass rate was 59%).
- Aga Khan Foundation's (AKF) Releasing Confidence and Creativity (RCC) Programme, which works in the rural areas of Sindh and Baluchistan provinces, was found to increase hand-eye coordination, short-term memory, picture comprehension, colour identification, and shape recognition, as well as some improvement in sight reading, writing own name, and drawing a person, when compared to baseline data.
- Children's Resources International's (CRI) Creating Democratic Schools (CDS) Programme, which works in the urban areas of Islamabad, Rawalpindi, and Karachi increased the literacy of family members which in turn had enhanced their confidence because they were able to read currency, medicine bottles, bills, write their names, and to learn to make things (arts and crafts).
- Four years into the Punjab Female School Stipend Program (FSSP), adolescent girls in stipend districts are more likely to progress through and complete middle school and work less. High school enrolment and completion was also improved.

2. Overview texts

Country study: Pakistan — where and who are the world's illiterates?

Choudhry, M. A., Background paper for EFA Global Monitoring Report 2006

<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001459/145959e.pdf>

Programmes and Practices to improve literacy:¹

The Nai Roshni School and Iqra Project started in 1986-87 for out-of-school children and adults. 15,000 Nai Roshni Schools were opened and 400,000 students registered who benefited from this programme. An evaluation in 1987 found that 95% of the schools were

¹ The original source for the first three projects is 'Quest for Adult Literacy', a report written by Dr. A. Ghafoor, Ex-chairman Pakistan Literacy Commission. It is no longer available.

functioning. Likewise, Iqra centres made 18,000 people literate. The programme was abandoned with the change in government.

Eradication of Illiteracy from Selected Areas of Pakistan was launched by the Prime Minister's Literacy Commission, at a cost of Rs. 72.83 million from 1992-94. The target was to make literate 174,460 adults through 3,460 face-to-face and 200 TV literacy centres in 5 select districts of all provinces. The project succeeded in making 138,025 (79%) adults literate, 87% were women.

Quranic Literacy Project 1992-94 at a cost of Rs.4.06 million, aimed to make women literate through their knowledge and reading skills of the Quran. The project was tested in 5 union councils in 4 districts surrounding Islamabad. To implement the programme, 494 face-to-face centres were established, at places provided by the community. The teacher was paid an honorarium of Rs.500 per month. Four cycles of 6 months each were completed. 10,867 women and girls were made literate through this project.

The Prime Minister's Literacy Commission in 1995 aimed to establish 10,000 Non-formal Basic Education Schools (NFBE) at a total cost of Rs. 1,263.375 million. NGOs and CBOs were supported to run home-schooling. In the Education Policy (1998-2010) it was recommended the programme be scaled up, by opening 75,000 NFBE Community Schools over the next three years. At present, around 9,000 NFBE Schools are functioning throughout the country with 300,000 students.

The MOE planned a Crash Literacy Programme in May 1998 aimed at promoting literacy and basic education in the country. The purpose of the programme was to increase participation rates by making maximum use of the available resources like school buildings and teachers during summer vacations and evening hours. About 87 literacy centres were opened in three phases with a total enrolment of around 1,500. The evaluation test conducted by the Ministry indicated that 82% passed these programmes.

The Punjab programme aimed to make 5,550 students literate and the Department was able to meet 96% of this target. Encouraged by the results of this programme, the Government of the Punjab undertook Phase II of the programme with a tenfold expansion. 1,668 centres with 30 students each were subsequently opened.

One of the priority areas of Education Sector Reforms (2001-06) was adult literacy. The government aim was to open 270,000 literacy centres in 5 years time to achieve the target of 60% literacy rate by the year 2006. However, due to financial constraints, only 6,000 literacy centres could be opened throughout the country. Each centre has completed 2 cycles of a 6-month duration at the average intake of 20-25 learners per centre per cycle. The total number made literate under this programme so far is around 240,000. Most of the centres are for women.

Besides these, around 2,500 literacy centres have been opened by the National Commission for Human Development – a support organisation of the MOE. Some of the districts also opened literacy centres out of their own budget/resources. At present 13,000 literacy centres, both public and private, have been opened. The North-West Frontier Province (NWFP) government has allocated funds to the NWFP Elementary Education Foundation to open 18,000 literacy centres in collaboration with the National Commission for Human Development. The Literacy and Non-formal Education Department of Punjab has launched a literacy project in 4 selected districts of southern Punjab. The centres have been effective at aiding women but not men.

NGOs have been actively involved in the promotion of literacy and adult education since 1990, including:

- Adult Basic Education Society (ABES)

- SHOAA in Balochistan
- Khyber Welfare Association in NWFP
- BUNYAD in Punjab

ABES and BUNYAD have both received an International Literacy Award from UNESCO.

Education in Pakistan: What works & why

Campaign for Quality Education, 2007

<http://www.cqe.net.pk/pdf/what-works-and-why.pdf>

The authors looked for five to six quality schools each at eight different sites across Pakistan. The schools were selected so as to cover a broad spectrum of organisational forms and support mechanisms in Pakistan, including:

- 1) government unassisted schools
- 2) government schools assisted by a programme [GTZ's Technical Assistance, Aga Khan University – Institute for Educational Development (AKU-IED) Whole School Improvement Program (WSIP), USAID's Education Sector Reform Assistance (ESRA), UNICEF's Child Friendly Schools]
- 3) stand-alone private schools, as well as private schools which are part of a school system [The Citizens Foundation (TCF), Hira National Education Foundation (HNEF), and Indus Resource Centre (IRC)].

All schools are listed in an annex of the paper. Based on student scores, fifteen top schools were identified at each site for in-depth visits for classroom observation and teacher interviews. A reasonable level of enrolment and availability of teachers as well as basic infrastructure and facilities were also considered.

A core Research Design Team (RDT), consisting of seven members drawn from academia and CSOs was set up to provide technical advice on research design, data collection and analysis, and writing of cases. Conceived as a multi-case study with individual schools as the unit cases, the study employed qualitative methods of inquiry. The data collection was also guided by local assumptions about what factors affect school quality. There was a primary emphasis on factors such as teacher professional development, monitoring and evaluation mechanisms at the school level and community participation, and a secondary emphasis on factors such as language, world view and gender. In order to validate the findings, the preliminary findings were taken back to the stakeholders including government functionaries, donors and local grassroots organisations, through a series of policy dialogues conducted at a central location in three of the provinces.

Findings and recommendations:

Investments in education in Pakistan in the past decade or so, both from government and donors, have been biased in favour of direct delivery of educational services such as teacher training, creation and training of school councils, supply of missing facilities, and financial and other incentives for students to attend schools. The policy cover for these investments has been provided by the international consensus on EFA and MDG. Investments, by for example, the World Bank and USAID, may be achieving worthwhile intermediate results, but they are not sufficient for sustainable reform. What is missing is a strategy for identifying the human resources with the potential to take reform forward, and a focused effort to create or sustain selective key institutions with real depth and capacity (as opposed to the many that are all form and no substance). Only where there is a combination of leadership and institutional support did schools seem capable of achieving quality.

The contents of the official curriculum and assessment practices often worked against the attempts to reform instructional practices in the case schools. The curriculum and assessment requirements favour rote memorisation, thus pushing even innovative schools to resort to rote learning particularly by Grade 4 or 5 just to get students through the government Grade-5 exams. The curriculum contents and assessment practices reinforce a

culture of unquestioning acceptance, which renders promotion of a more open and inclusive world view difficult. Teachers were not observed to go beyond the limits and biases in the textbooks.

Recommendations focus on identification and promotion of the promising human resources present within the schools, provision of a meaningful system of incentives to teachers and putting school leaders in place to help improve the quality of schools.

Reforms need institutions to support them. Quality in some of the case schools was sustained by key institutions such as in the case of the Whole School Improvement Program (WSIP). Even temporary arrangements such as ESRA seemed to be making a difference and teachers attempted to use innovative methods in their classroom teaching. Although in the latter case the very nature of a project mode indicates a lack of continuity.

The organisational form of the school council does not, in most cases, translate into effective community involvement. If anything, it often places the teachers and the school in an adversarial relationship with only lip service being paid to the community-school partnership that the school council is supposed to represent. It would be more useful and potentially effective to capture community involvement through a more flexible less prescriptive approach. Consequently, before investing more funds in the enterprise of School Councils the form, purpose and nature of community support to schools needs to be reviewed by the government.

The research team was developing strategies for an in-depth study of each recommendation. Three examples² of promising programmes:

1. WSIP is a whole school improvement programme initiated by the AKU-IED which works with schools over the course of 3 years in six areas: quality of teaching and learning; leadership, management and administration; curriculum enrichment and staff development; building, resources and accommodation; health, hygiene and moral development of students; and community participation.
2. GTZ has worked closely with the NWFP Department of Education over the past 10 years to reform in-service teacher training, the latest project being Education Sector Development Program (ESDP). It has provided technical assistance in training over 60,000 teachers in the government sector, developing training materials as well as skilled master trainers, working on textbook reform in the province by developing textbook writers and monitoring teacher development. They have also assisted in developing cluster based teacher support through mentor teachers.
3. The ESRA programme is a \$74.5 million initiative funded by USAID in support of the Government of Pakistan's ESR effort. USAID/ESRA operates across 6 technical areas (policy and planning, professional development, literacy, public-community partnerships, public-private partnerships, and information and communication technologies), in 13 educational jurisdictions (9 districts, 2 provinces, the Islamabad Capital Territory, and the Federal Ministry of Education).

Inclusive and Child Friendly Schools in Pakistan: Best practices and challenges

Children's Global, Network, Pakistan, 2010

[http://www.cgnpk.org/PDF/ICFSP_Nov2010\(Final\).pdf](http://www.cgnpk.org/PDF/ICFSP_Nov2010(Final).pdf)

Organisations working for the creation of CFS identify a wide repertoire of techniques which can be used to implement core CFS dimensions. Efforts aimed at enhancing inclusiveness through increasing enrolments and reducing drop outs have followed three main strategies: i) financial incentives, ii) community mobilisation, and iii) capacity building of teachers.

² Studies of ESRA and WSIP are given below.

Prominent best practices aimed at inculcating child centeredness in classrooms are training workshops for teachers and administrators, provision of learning material and guides for children and teachers, refresher trainings and technical assistance for teachers and administrators.

The work of The Citizens Foundation (TCF) and the National Commission for Human Development (NCHD) can be classified as major contributors for accelerating literacy rates across the country. Gender sensitivity is prioritised and inculcated through increasing the number of female teachers, providing separate washroom facilities, sensitising all levels of educational management to gender-related issues and equal opportunities for involvement in co-curricular activities. Best practices in the field of inclusive education for children with disabilities include the Ameen Maktab Outreach programme and the Inclusive Education school run by the Association for the Rehabilitation of the Physically Disabled, Peshawar.

3. Sector-wide analysis/studies

Annual status of education report (ASER) 2010 Pakistan

http://www.google.co.uk/url?sa=t&source=web&cd=2&ved=0CCoQFjAB&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.planningcommission.gov.pk%2Ffusefull%2520links%2FASER-2010%2FASER-2010%2520National.ppt&rct=j&q=pakistan%20Annual%20status%20of%20education%20report%202010&ei=BHA6TprOL42FhQfk8ayCAg&usg=AFQjCNHw-LHrK52kqk96NstlzPz7_BY7tQ&sig2=K_2QIVxdgqghbQG1Lfn_7Q

and

Annual status of education report (ASER) 2010 (Rural) Pakistan

http://www.google.co.uk/url?sa=t&source=web&cd=3&ved=0CDEQFjAC&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.planningcommission.gov.pk%2Ffusefull%2520links%2FASER-2010%2FASER-2010%2520FAQs.pdf&ei=BHA6TprOL42FhQfk8ayCAg&usg=AFQjCNEYxwGhpubNuVfBRY_7vnQX_DZ2RHA&sig2=-BdMJXyi70YNkKEXdgoyiQ

Statistics are provided for learning in reading, English and arithmetic disaggregated by province and by private or public school. The levels appear to be low (although higher for private schools).

National Assessment Findings 2006

http://www.neas.gov.pk/Document%20Center_files/Dissemination/NEASAssessFindings2006.zip

The National Education Assessment System (NEAS) was planned as a sample-based national assessment, to be conducted at Grade 4 and Grade 8, in four subjects - Language, Mathematics, Science and Social Studies/Islamiyat/Life Skills.

Results for the 2006 National Assessments show that the average scores of Grade 4 students are below the scaled average score of 500. This means that the average mark obtained by all students is less than 50% of the possible marks in each of the four subjects tested (Urdu, Mathematics, General Science and Social Studies).

During every cycle of assessment, background data is gathered by giving questionnaires to students and parents, head teachers and teachers, and, through the analysis of monitoring reports. The conditions and facilities in the schools are also observed and recorded and the background data is then correlated with students' achievements to identify the factors associated with achievement and also needs for improvement. Some results include:

- Teachers' use of the blackboard during lessons significantly increased students' achievement in all 4 subjects. 97% of teachers reported using the blackboard daily.

- Students who never got punished by their teachers performed significantly better. 59% of students reported they never got punished. Only .03% of students reported frequent punishment. Rewarding students' performance increased achievement in all subjects.
- Teacher training appeared to have little effect on student achievement. Teacher training in various subject content areas, methodology, subject curriculum, improving students' critical thinking, and, problem solving, did not significantly increase students' learning achievement.
- The questionnaires inquired into the effect of different kinds of assessment on student achievement such as verbal, written, assessment of homework and assessment of the class performance of students. The forms of assessment which were identified as having significant influence on students' achievement in all subjects were written assessments and the assessment of homework.

Learning Levels and Gaps in Pakistan

Das, J., P. Pandey, and T. Zajonc., World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 4067. The World Bank, Washington, DC., 2006

<http://www->

wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/IW3P/IB/2006/11/10/000016406_20061110130529/Rendered/PDF/wps4067.pdf

The authors report on a survey of primary public and private schools in rural Pakistan with a focus on student achievement as measured through test scores. Absolute learning is low compared with curricular standards and international norms. Tested at the end of the third grade, a bare majority had mastered the K-I mathematics curriculum and only 31% could correctly form a sentence with the word "school" in the vernacular (Urdu). As in high-income countries, comparisons show that higher learning is associated with household wealth and parental literacy. In sharp contrast to high-income countries, these gaps decrease dramatically in a multivariate regression once differences between children in the same school are looked at. Consequently, the largest gaps are between schools. The gap in English test scores between government and private schools, for instance, is 12 times the gap between children from rich and poor families.

Assessing achievement of primary grader students and factors affecting achievement in Pakistan

Muhammad Saeed, Muhammad Bashir Gondal, Bushra, *International Journal of Educational Management*, Vol. 19: 6, pp.486-499, 2005

This study aimed to focus on achievement level of primary grade students in different subjects and the factors affecting the student achievement. The study was carried out on a sample of 1,080 students of Grade 3 and 5 drawn from 36 randomly-selected primary/elementary schools from 9 districts of the Punjab province. The instruments were: the achievement tests in three subjects: mathematics, Urdu (national language) and life skills (Islamyat, social studies and science); and questionnaires for teachers and students to know various possible factors affecting achievement.

Results show that the achievement was the lowest in the subject of Urdu (mean 15.2) and the highest in life skills (mean 29.9) in Grade 3. While in Grade 5, it was the lowest in mathematics (mean 10.8) and the highest in life skills (31.63). Overall, the performance of the female students was relatively better than their male partners. Location-wise, the rural students performed better than the urban students. District-wise, the performance of students of Rajanpur and Rahim Yar Khan districts was relatively better than the students of district Kasur and Bahawalpur. Among the factors affecting students' achievement were parental education, their occupation and guidance, teacher guidance, social status, transport facility, self study, book reading and homework – all have a positive or negative correlation with students' achievement.

Education in Pakistan: A White Paper (revised): Document to Debate and Finalize the National Education Policy

Javed Hasan Aly, National Education Policy Review Team, Pakistan Government, 2007
<http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/upload/Pakistan/Pakistan%20National%20Education%20Policy%20Review%20WhitePaper.pdf>

This paper includes a critique of using examinations to measure education achievements. The examinations in Pakistan are infested with a number of problems that make them poor representatives of the efficiency of the system. In the last few years, their ability to determine merit has been eroded in the wake of widespread malpractices that allow cheating.

Pakistan: Learning and Educational Achievements in Punjab Schools (LEAPS): Insights to inform the education policy debate

Andrabi, et al and the LEAPS team, World Bank, 2007
http://www.leapsproject.org/assets/publications/LEAPS_Report_FINAL.pdf
http://www.leapsproject.org/assets/publications/LEAPS_Report_ExecSummary.pdf

This report shares the findings of the first round of the Learning and Educational Achievement in Punjab Schools (LEAPS) survey carried out in all the public and private schools offering primary-level education in 112 villages of the province in 2003 along with trends for a few key outcomes between 2003 and 2007. This survey includes learning outcomes for 12,000 children in Class III in Urdu, English and Mathematics together with detailed information on the beliefs and behaviour of schools, teachers and parents.

Learning outcomes are poor. They have little to do with where you live, and everything to do with whether you go to a public or private school. The differences between public and private schools are so large that it will take government school students between 1.5 to 2.5 years of additional schooling to catch up to where private school students were in Class 3. It also costs less to educate a child in a private school. Putting learning and cost differences together, the quality-adjusted-cost in government schools is three times higher than in private schools.

Between 2003 and 2006, children in Class III learning outcomes were stagnant for English and declined fractionally in Urdu and Mathematics. These outcomes did not improve either in government or private schools; consequently the gap between the two remains as large in 2006 as it was in 2003.

More information available at: <http://www.leapsproject.org/site/resources/>

Study on Access and Equity In Basic Education

Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Ministry of Education Islamabad, June 2004
<http://www.aepam.edu.pk/Download/Sabir%20Reports/Access%20&%20Equity.doc>

This is a study to assess the learning achievement of Grade 5 students in both public and private schools in Pakistan. For the study, 12 districts were selected and from each district, 12 primary schools - 8 government and 4 private schools were randomly selected, and from each school 20 students studying in Grade 5 were randomly picked for testing. In all, 3,442 students, comprising 1,943 boys and 1,499 girls were assessed.

Private school students out-performed their public schools counterparts. Interestingly, it found that teachers' academic and professional qualification had a positive influence on student achievement in general and particularly on the achievement of girl students. Also, it found that teachers' qualifications had greater influence on the performance of urban students than rural students. The students taught by matriculate teachers obtained the highest score

followed by students taught by intermediate level qualified teachers in the urban area. Students taught by the teachers who do not hold BA/MA degrees secured the highest score.

As far as gender was concerned, teachers' professional qualifications seem to have more impact on girls' performance on the tests, than on boys in both rural and urban schools. The study also found that teaching experience matters when it comes to student achievement, and that it had more positive impact on girls' performance than boys, as well as on the urban student than the rural student.

Non-profit Education Providers vis-à-vis the Private Sector: Comparative Analysis of Non-Governmental Organizations and Traditional Voluntary Organizations in Pakistan³ by Masooda Bano, *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education* 38 (4), pages 471 to 482, 2008

International development institutions encourage non-profit organisations to provide education in developing countries. They argue that these organisations deliver education more efficiently than the state and more equitably than the private sector. But non-profit organisations may be driven by different concerns, and cannot replace the state. Research from the University of Oxford distinguishes between the education provided by two kinds of non-profit organisations: NGOs and Traditional Voluntary Organisations (TVOs). The study considers whether they can provide meaningful education for large numbers of poor people and if they are distinct from the state and the market.

About half of Pakistan's 45,000 registered non-profit organisations provide education. Pakistan's current Education Sector Reform plan emphasises the role of education provision by NGOs, to address the problems of equity caused by private education that poor people cannot afford. The study argues that rather than addressing the needs of poor people, NGOs cultivate education markets for the private sector. Drawing on a survey of 20 prominent non-profit education providers in Pakistan during 2003 and 2004, the study compares NGOs and TVOs, and finds that:

- TVOs emphasise formal education, matriculation and certification. They help academic students enter higher or vocational education.
- NGOs focus on non-formal education as a process, whereby a project targets a village and engages the community to provide locally appropriate education.
- TVO schools use buildings with separate classrooms, tables and chairs for students.
- NGO schools use donated one-room buildings, with children often sitting on the floor.
- All TVO teachers have university degrees and most have government teaching certificates. NGO teachers are more intensely trained and monitored.
- NGOs experiment with innovative teaching methods, 'child-centred' learning and audio-visual aids.
- TVOs claim post-secondary education is crucial to move out of poverty. NGOs consider non-formal education as the only way to reach poor children in remote communities.

Findings reveal that NGO and TVO education programmes differ more in structure than in teaching practice. TVOs aim to promote better livelihoods through education and work with a philosophy of social responsibility. NGOs are tied to the donor funding cycle and refer to education as a Millennium Development Goal. Both emphasise participation but TVOs mobilise the middle and upper classes, whereas NGOs focus on community participation and are totally reliant upon donor money.

³ Summary based on ID21 summary - <http://www.eldis.org/id21ext/e2mb1g1.html> [accessed 08/08/2011]

Policymakers should be aware that:

- Non-profit organisations do not mitigate the negative effects of privatisation and cannot replace the state in serving poor people.
- NGOs should be seen as part of the private sector as they create willingness amongst parents to pay for education and desire amongst children to attend school.
- TVOs cannot reach all poor people, but NGOs create a market for the private sector rather than meet the needs of poor people

4. Programmes evaluations – sector-wide

National Literacy Programme (NLP): Country Profile: Pakistan (2002 - ongoing)

National Commission for Human Development (NCHD) Government of Pakistan

<http://www.unesco.org/ui/litbase/?menu=4&programme=66> [last accessed 08/08/2011]

The NLP is an integrated literacy programme which particularly targets out-of-school children, young people and adult women and is currently being implemented across the entire nation, covering the country's 122 districts and effectively operating in about 50,000 villages. The NLP endeavours to promote family literacy training and intergenerational learning based on the principle that the enrolment and retention of children in school is largely a function of family support. Accordingly, improving the literacy levels of parents or family members is regarded as an essential instrument in ensuring access to education for children and young people.

The NLP is divided into three broad components:

- The Universal Primary Education (UPE) programme has facilitated the establishment of about 21,000 community-based feeder schools (CBFSs) in 50,000 villages and trained over 21,000 community-based literacy facilitators (feeder teachers). In addition, the UPE programme has also provided in-service and professional advancement training to 313,287 primary school teachers. These strategies have enabled about 7,879,253 out-of-school children (aged five to nine years) to have access to education resulting in a marked increase in the net enrolment ratio in primary school (from 52% to 87%) in most districts. Additionally, strong community mobilisation, including the mobilisation of about 40,000 volunteers, has resulted in a significant reduction in the drop-out rate: from 50% to 18% in most districts where the UPE programme has been implemented.
- The Adult Literacy Programme (ALP) - The design, development and implementation of the NLP is based on a tripartite partnership between the NCHD, District Education Department (DED) (including schools and teachers) and communities (including volunteer literacy teachers). A particularly innovative and critical feature of the ALP is its emphasis on social mobilisation and community involvement in programme implementation.
- The Post-Literacy Programme - NCHD has initiated a six-month (132 days/264 learning hours) Post-Literacy Programme (PLP) to provide ALP graduates and out-of-school young people with opportunities for continuing education, leading to enrolment in formal primary, secondary or vocational education and engagement in secure income generation activities. Apart from consolidating the learners' literacy skills, the PLP also endeavours to empower them through functional literacy learning and vocational training. To this end, the PLP emphasises training in, for example, literacy (mathematics, English, Urdu), health, agriculture (crop, fish, poultry and livestock production), life skills (peace-building, conflict management and resolution), food processing and preservation and dressmaking. NCHD has opened 3,500 post-literacy centres in order to facilitate the efficient implementation of the PLP.

Comprehensive programme evaluations were undertaken by UNDP (2004, 2006) and Shell Pakistan (2005).⁴ The NLP has established about 120,263 adult literacy centres in 122 districts and as a result, about 2,555,606 adult learners (95% of whom are women) have graduated from the programme and are now able to read and write. The programme has significantly targeted and benefited women as they are better able to participate in community development activities as well as to contribute to the well-being of their families. Parents are now more able to support the education of their children, especially girls. The programme has also raised women's awareness regarding critical social issues, particularly childcare, reproductive health and the risks of early marriages.

Child Friendly Schools in Punjab Province, Pakistan

UNICEF (2008)

<http://www.unicef.org/pakistan/CFS.pdf>

A child-friendly school is:

- Rights-based and inclusive: Every child-friendly school proactively seeks out-of-school children and encourages them to enroll, irrespective of gender, race, ability or social status.
- Gender-sensitive: They promote equality and equity in enrolment and achievement among girls and boys by eliminating gender stereotyping. They guarantee gender-sensitive facilities, curricula and textbooks.
- Safe and protective: They ensure that all children can learn in a safe and protective environment. This is increasingly supported by strong violence-prevention policies and innovative mechanisms that allow pupils to report abuse.
- Community-engaged: A child-friendly school is embedded in its local community, encouraging partnerships among parents, teachers and children in all aspects of the education process.
- Academically effective: Teachers at a child-friendly school encourage classroom participation and adopt interactive, child-centred, gender-sensitive and effective teaching methods. This approach provides children with relevant knowledge and skills not just for surviving but also for thriving in life.
- Health-promoting: Child-friendly schooling also promotes the physical and emotional health of children by meeting key nutritional and healthcare needs through appropriate school meals and health checks, including regular immunisation and de-worming campaigns and the provision of vitamin A supplements.

In September 2004, UNICEF formed a partnership with the Ali Institute of Education to pilot Child-friendly schools in Punjab. The institute implemented the project in six districts through its Training and Resource Centre (TARC) Programme: centres for teacher training. Each TARC was staffed by 3 Professional Development Teachers trained in the child-friendly school model, and with experience and knowledge of the subjects taught in primary school. The TARC team conducted a needs analysis in 25 schools creating a snapshot of primary needs in all these schools. The first set of teacher training took place in 2005 and included both subject-based learning and training on teaching methods and classroom management. Head teachers were separately trained in managing child-friendly schools and in using community resources to attract and retain more students. In 2008, 25 new schools were added to each TARC. The total number of child-friendly schools in the 6 districts is now 300 with about 51,000 children enrolled.

An evaluation by Dr. Ken Vine (Academic Performance of Students in Child-Friendly School in the Punjab, 2008⁵) comparing learning achievements in child-friendly schools and non child-friendly schools showed that girls and boys alike had better results overall in the 2006

⁴ These studies are not available online.

⁵ This evaluation is not available online.

Grade 5 public examinations. Girls performed at significantly higher levels overall but boys excelled at science and maths.

Final Assessment of the Pakistan Teacher Education and Professional Development Program

Kjell Enge and Shahid Akbar, consultants, Los Angeles: Juárez and Associates, Inc., 2007
http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PDACL611.pdf

The Pakistan Teacher Education and Professional Development Programme (PTEPDP) was a three-year training project implemented from June 2003 to October 2006 by the Academy for Educational Development through USAID/Pakistan. The programme was designed to increase the number of teacher trainers from teacher colleges in Pakistan that are responsible for training primary school teachers in the teaching of mathematics, science and ESL in the use of new and improved teaching methods. A small group of teacher training institute administrators was included in the project as well. During the first stage 172 teacher trainers were trained at three US universities. The programme was also designed to build the capacity of teacher training institutes in Pakistan through the establishment of long-range linkages between US universities and their counterparts in Pakistan. During the second stage of the programme 200 teacher trainers were trained in Pakistan through an in-country master teacher trainers programme.

The methods employed by the evaluation team consisted of the following three phase approach to assess the programme:

- In-depth interviews were carried out with programme participants using carefully designed protocols followed by content analysis that provided views and perceptions on how new knowledge and practices were implemented and their assessments on the strengths and weaknesses of the programme
- Direct classroom observations were made in Government College for Elementary Teachers where classes were being conducted by PTEPDP alumni.
- Interviews were also done with former AED PTEPDP staff in Pakistan and the US and with representatives from the three participating universities.

The classroom observations made in Punjab and Balochistan indicate that the student teachers perform better by being more actively involved in course activities. Also, the PTEPDP alumni teaching them claim that their students do better as a result of using the new methods. However, it was beyond the scope of this assessment to compare the academic achievement of the students' of the alumni in relation to the other student teachers, but the indirect evidence from the observations and the interviews indicate that there have been notable changes in performance.

Audit of USAID/Pakistan's Education Sector Reform Assistance Program

Audit report no. 5-391-08-004-P, USAID, 2008
<http://www.usaid.gov/oig/public/fy08rpts/5-391-08-004-p.pdf>

This audit could not determine whether USAID/Pakistan's ESRA programme achieved intended results because the audit team could not rely on the mission's monitoring of the ESRA programme or on RTI's reporting of the programme's achievements against the targets.

Two further studies of the Education Sector Reform Assistance (ESRA) are summarised below:

Impact of Educational Sector Reform Assistance (ESRA) Professional Development Programme on School Improvement (research article)

Tarique Bhatti and Parveen Munshi, Govt: Degree College & Post Graduate Centre, Latifabad, Hyderabad and Department of Psychological Testing, Guidance & Research, Faculty of Education, Elsa Kazi Campus University of Sindh, Hyderabad
[http://www.aku.edu/ied/conference2008/doc/Papers/Impact%20of%20Educational%20Sector%20Reform%20Assistance%20\(ESRA\)%20Parveen%20Munshi.pdf](http://www.aku.edu/ied/conference2008/doc/Papers/Impact%20of%20Educational%20Sector%20Reform%20Assistance%20(ESRA)%20Parveen%20Munshi.pdf)

ESRA was a USAID-funded initiative to support the education reform process in Pakistan and was implemented by a consortium of partners, led by RTI⁶ with the aim of assisting the government in implementing its new education plans. Under ESRA, a professional development programme of in-service training to primary school teachers and administrators in four districts (Hyderabad, Thatta, Khairpur, Sukkur), was provided between 2003 and 2007.

This research study interviewed 186 men and 163 women teachers from the 20 best declared model primary schools of three sub-divisions of Hyderabad District. Data were collected through questionnaires, personal observations and interviews. Although some teachers had moved towards more student centred learning practices, in most of the schools teachers still tended to employ traditional teaching methods. This was due to a shortage of resources and a lack of administrative support.

Improving public school teachers in Pakistan: challenges and opportunities

Hussain and Hajid , Improving Schools, March 2010 vol. 13 no. 1 70-80

<http://www.deepdyve.com/lp/sage/improving-public-school-teachers-in-pakistan-challenges-and-noYnxfv01p>

ESRA initiated a programme to train government school teachers in selected districts of Sindh and Balochistan with technical assistance from the Research Triangle Institute (RTI) and funding support from USAID. Khan University – Institute for Educational Development (AKU-IED) implemented a field-based teacher development programme based on its previous experiences of a similar programme in Balochistan 1997–9. The overall AKU-IED programme was quite large but this article specifically focuses on one of the most important aspect of the programme – the cluster-based mentoring programme. The programme intended to develop mentoring capacities in nine selected districts of Sindh and Balochistan provinces benefiting thousands of public school teachers between 2004 and 2006.

The workshops helped them build their content knowledge, pedagogy and use of learning aids. These in turn made their lessons much more attractive and enjoyable for the students. Although it is still early to suggest any improvement in students' learning, the anecdotal experiences suggest a positive outcome among majority of the students. Students were found to be regular, engaged and active in their classrooms. These conclusions are not based on research but on the experiences of the authors gathered during the implementation of the model.

Also in

Evaluation of Cluster-Based Mentoring Programme for Teachers' Professional Development in Sindh and Balochistan

Hussain, R., Rahim, H. and Ali, S., Karachi, Aga Khan University, Institute for Educational Development, 2007

Northern Education Project (NEP): Project Information Document (PID) Concept Stage

World Bank, date either 2005 or 6

http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2005/04/27/000104615_20050427120250/Rendered/PDF/Project0Inform1ment010Concept0Stage.pdf

⁶ The acronym is not given in full but is likely to be Right to Information Pakistan.

The Northern Education Project (NEP) - Credit 2992-PAK, which began in February 1998 and closed in September 2003, was the first donor-assisted project in Northern Areas. It helped improve access to quality education, strengthen the Department of Education's capacity and enhance government-community partnerships. Achievement of outcomes under the project was substantial, including:

- establishment of baselines for student achievement for the first time in the country, with modest increases in achievement scores in key subjects
- instructional improvement through the use of teaching aids, multi-grade and continuous assessment, new textbooks, and field-based teacher training.

Establishment of monitoring and evaluation system, a Geographic Information System (GIS), production of on-time reports, annual plans, evaluation studies and surveys, and the integration of student achievement data into an EMIS

Impact and sustainability of the whole school improvement program, professional development centre, North. Unpublished research report

Shamim, F, Karachi, Pakistan: Aga Khan University, Institute for Educational Development, 2005

<http://www.aku.edu/ied/raps/Documents/WSIP.pdf>

The Professional Development Centre (PDCN) of the AKU-IED, located in the Northern areas of Pakistan initiated the Whole School Improvement Program (WSIP) in the year 2000 for improving the quality of education in schools in Northern Areas. A central agenda for WSIP was to work with the three education systems in the Northern Areas, i.e. government, Aga Khan Education services (AKES) and the not-for-profit schools run by NGOs. The programme was designed after a needs analysis survey showed the ineffectiveness of earlier models that focused on building the capacity of individual teachers through centrally organised training programmes.

The general aim of WSIP is to improve opportunities for children to learn through whole school improvement. Six areas were identified for focused work and input in project schools:

1. quality of teaching and learning
2. leadership, management and administration
3. community participation
4. curriculum and staff development
5. building, accommodation and resources
6. social and moral development of students and health education.

WSIP has had an impact, during the intervention stage of the programme, in all the schools in the Northern Areas, despite differences in their other characteristics. There was evidence of visible improvement in the learning conditions in project schools and classrooms. WSIP interventions did not focus explicitly on increasing student achievement levels as reflected in exam results.⁷ However, WSIP's focus on the holistic development of the child seemed to have had a positive impact on students' behaviour. Often, the project team members and the head also succeeded in mobilising community support, particularly through the involvement of mothers in their child's education. At post-intervention stage, however, the changes introduced during the intervention stage of the programme, were found to have been sustained, at varied levels, in a few schools only.

The impact of WSIP during intervention is likely due mainly to the programme's focus on the capacity building of teachers and head teacher in all project schools through formal programmes /workshops for professional development and providing school-based support.

⁷ This is contradicted in the study by the Campaign for Education (2007) that say that exam results in the WSIP programme are good.

Important determinants of the sustainability of WSIP impact during the post-intervention phase of the programme are:

- support from the head and/or the school system and the presence of a critical mass of WSIP teachers and/or head in a school
- systematic follow-up support, wherever available, facilitated the consolidation of changes introduced during the intervention phase. It seemed that changes that were supported by the school system were easier to sustain than those which conflicted with the systems' goals and procedures for schools improvement.

Education in the Northern Areas

Gowani and Arnold, Aga Khan Foundation, 2007

http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EDUCATION/Resources/278200-1121703274255/1439264-1178054414297/zaharakassam_whole.doc.pdf

Concentrated in Northern Pakistan and Sindh, the Aga Khan Education Service, Pakistan operates 186 AKES, P schools and supports 200 community-based and some 75 government schools all over Pakistan. These enrol about 62,000 children at any one time.

One of the distinguishing features of the AKES, P system is its emphasis on girls' education. Teachers learn easy-to implement, child-centred active learning methods. Many AKES, P kacchi (pre-school) classrooms have established learning corners, where children learn basic concepts and through play lay the foundations for subsequent more academic learning.

At present, the only examinations which are common across all schools, and which are therefore comparable, are those at the end of the final year of high school (Year 10). The general pass rate for all students for 2004-2005 was 59%. The pass rate for AKES, P students was 88%. Additionally, 57 of the 68 students achieving A1 (the highest distinction) attended AKES, P schools.

Creating Democratic Schools Program

Children's Resource International / Pact (Under Leader Award No. Geg-A-00-01-00005-00)
And

Releasing Confidence And Creativity Program

Aga Khan Foundation (Grant No. 391-G-00-04-01020-00)

In

Early Childhood Education In Pakistan: Evaluation Report of USAID's Supported Programs

Rich-Orloff et al, DevTech Systems, Inc., 2007

http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PDACK938.pdf

The two programmes requested by USAID/Pakistan to be evaluated were Aga Khan Foundation's (AKF) Releasing Confidence and Creativity (RCC) Programme, which works in the rural areas of Sindh and Baluchistan provinces, and the Children's Resources International's (CRI) Creating Democratic Schools (CDS) Programme, which works in the urban areas of Islamabad, Rawalpindi, and Karachi. The evaluation was to determine the effectiveness of both programmes in regards to cost as well as to stated programme goals and objectives.

The evaluation process included classroom and school observations, document reviews and analysis, and in-depth and focus group interviews with children, teachers, parents, community members, programme implementing staff, government officials at all levels, and other organisations working in the field of early childhood in Pakistan.

Child learning outcomes of the RCC programme reported and observed:

- Children stated that they liked coming "to work and to play"; one child said she liked to go to the science area; another liked the creativity area. Children said they liked to play with each other (children's interviews).

- Monitoring results for Phase I of the RCC programme demonstrated an increase in hand-eye coordination, short-term memory, picture comprehension, colour identification, and shape recognition, as well as some improvement in sight reading, writing own name, and drawing a person when compared to baseline data. Data monitoring Phase II of the RCC programme was not available for review.

Community learning outcomes reveal:

- The WVEC functioning in one community had empowered women to take ‘the RCC message’ to parents and ensure that objectives of the programme were achieved. They participated by visiting classrooms and creating materials for the school. They visited homes to reduce absenteeism and increase enrolment, and they sometimes taught in the classroom; volunteer charts were visible in the classroom.
- The Education Council had been formed within each district of Baluchistan. These councils were comprised of a representative from each of the PTSMCs within a certain cluster. They were responsible for strengthening activities of SMCs, and for working at the district administration level to solve issues that arose. They also generated funds from the community and made efforts to install water tanks and make minor school repairs. They visited schools frequently, sometimes alone/unannounced, and checked student/teacher absenteeism. School competitions were organised between RCC schools.
- The communities showed an awareness of what early childhood entails. They stated that RCC schools provided a friendly environment for children where there was no punishment and no pressure of books and where children learned through play. There was no rote memorisation and the creative capability of children was enhanced and therefore there was a demand from parents that RCC be introduced in all schools.

However, the RCC programme included the “separate classroom, separate teacher” concept which created a disconnect with the government system. Community teachers were not recognised by the government system, as had been hoped by RCC. The programme had a weak system in place to facilitate the programme continuation when support was withdrawn, due to issues like frequent transfers and a lack of understanding/commitment to their early childhood concept.

Achievements for the CDS programme included such benefits as: strong relationship and advocacy with government at all levels, as well as with other organizations; use of existing infrastructure of government schools; robust Family Literacy and Parent Involvement components, especially in Islamabad and Rawalpindi; increased attendance and retention rates; and provision of materials for classrooms.

Family learning outcomes of the family literacy component:

- Not only parents, but other family members, including grandmothers, aunts, and siblings, were able to participate and become literate.
- Parents reported that the programme had impacted their lives, it had enhanced their confidence, and as a result of enrolling in the programme they were able to read currency, medicine bottles, bills, write their names, and to learned to make things (arts and crafts).
- Some parents had started their own small businesses as a result of the skills and confidence they gained from participating in the Family Literacy component.

Community learning outcomes reveal:

- In a majority of schools, parents were involved in activities, and were invited to the classroom to conduct activities with the children. One mother was observed teaching children a math lesson.

- Five of eight classrooms visited in Islamabad and Rawalpindi had parental involvement charts displayed in the classroom.
- In one school the SMC created water storage for the school.
- Teachers were very accepting of parents coming into the classroom and working with them.

However, major findings for the CDS programme included: a missing link between the training teachers received and the implementation of the methodology in the classrooms on a consistent basis; weak technical assistance weak in terms of monitoring teachers' practice; and weak parent involvement, a large component of the programme, in Karachi-based schools.

Both RCC and CDS programmes focused only on certain classrooms/sections in targeted schools for ECE interventions. This limitation has created disparities among classrooms and schools.

An important literacy programmes mentioned in other texts but for which an evaluation could not be located:

The Faisalabad experiment: Putting children at the centre of education

3 August 2007, DFID website [accessed 10/08/2011]

<http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/http://www.dfid.gov.uk/casestudies/files/asia/pakistan-faisalabad-experiment.asp>

DFID was funding an innovative new approach to education in Faisalabad -where almost half of all children are out of school and examination results are amongst the worst in the Punjab province. The needs of children are put at the centre of schooling.

Before it got off the ground, the project listened to pupils, discovering what they wanted from their teachers and from school as a whole. Students told them that teachers should love and respect their students and be polite, honest and hardworking. Children also asked for the right equipment so they could take an interest in science, and a library so they could enhance their knowledge.

The District Government set its goals and built a strategy, including addressing corporal punishment and non-attentive teachers, and developing teaching more sensitive to pupils' needs. At the newly established Institute of Learning, teachers could become master trainers, able to impart child-focussed teaching skills to heads, other teachers and members of local communities. So far, 241 head teachers and 490 teachers have benefited, along with 180 community members.

The methods of the Institute revolve around activity-based learning, a vast change from the traditional Pakistani method of learning by rote. Teachers undertake the same activities as their pupils, enabling them to see for themselves how it is to learn. With manuals now being developed, these techniques will be passed on to others. For some of those receiving training, this is the first time they have been taught in a pleasant and understanding manner. This has inspired teachers to treat their pupils equally well.

In one particular school there has been a marked increase in enrolment and attendance. No pupils have dropped out during the first year, and students are even enrolling from a school nearby. Teachers have commented that "through activity-based learning children have become more confident and active", and "the most difficult lessons have become easier for us to teach - children are understanding the real meaning of them."

A number of Faisalabad's schools have now been selected as "Lighthouse Schools". These

will train teachers in activity-based learning and have small libraries where neighbouring schools can access training materials.

5. Programmes evaluations – a focus on excluded children

Documenting Educational Innovations: A research Study

Sarwar et al, Sindh Education Foundation, Karachi

http://www.sef.org.pk/iie/cef_report_hr.pdf

This is a study of innovate models of education being practiced by NGOs and CSOs for marginalised/excluded children. Research methods included: interviews with key organisational personnel, schools visits and the collation of quantitative information.

Example programmes

- Idara-E-Taleem-O-AAgahi runs an adopt-a-school programme whereby they take over failed or underused public schools.
- Society for the Advancement of Education (SAHE) has set up community based schools for girls where facilities previously did not exist and encourage community involvement. They have managed to retina girls in education through for example developing local materials that localise subjects to district concerns and so the relevance to their students. They also encourage students to keep scrapbooks.
- GODH has set up community schools for gypsies aged 4-18. The schools only imposes the State curriculum from Grade 5 – before then they use internally developed material that is more that caters to the requirements of older illiterate children.
- The Zingdadi Trust has field officers that make a financial pact with the employer of the children. Generally part of the child's wage is given to the employer and more than the rest made up by the Trust – this has lead to a very high retention of students (96%).
- The Association of Networks for Community Empowerment (ANCE) allows children to be flexible about the hours they attend school which enables them to fit school in with the demands of work. Homework is also limited for the same reason. The school also maintains a relationship with employers to ensure that the children are not abused.

Report on impact assessment and evaluation of Tawana Pakistan Project⁸

Soofi S, Hlibi I, Feroz A, Bhutta Z.. Sindh Province: Department of Pediatrics, Aga Khan University, 2006

In Pakistan, a large-scale school lunch programme was implemented in 29 of the poorest rural districts through a public-private partnership. The project provided freshly prepared meals in 4,035 government primary girls' schools over a 2 year period. The primary strategy was empowerment of women in the community who volunteered to plan the meals, purchase the food, and cook and serve the meals. The project collected data from growth monitoring, attendance records, pre- and post-intervention community based surveys, focus group discussions, and the use of other ethnographic methods. This particular evaluation in one province (Sindh), which included control schools, documented improved learning among schools where girl students received feeding.

Another study of this programme showed an improvement in girls' school enrolment of 40%:
Community-based approaches to combating malnutrition and poor education among girls in resource-poor settings: report of a large scale intervention in Pakistan

⁸ This study is not available online but is described in Pappas et al 2008.

Pappas G, Agha A, Rafique G, Khan KS, Badruddin SH, Peermohamed H., *Rural and Remote Health* 8 (online), 2008
<http://www.rrh.org.au/articles/subviewAsia.asp?ArticleID=820>

Getting the Girls to School: The Community Schools Project in Gilgit-Baltistan of Pakistan

Dr. Mola Dad Shafa, *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, Vol 2, no.7, special issue, 2011
<http://www.ijbssnet.com/journals/Vol. 2 No. 7; Special Issue April 2011/26.pdf>

This paper reviews a ten-year, two-phase educational project that, amongst its main aims, attempted to increase significantly the enrolment of girls in schools. This project was part of a national initiative known as the Social Action Program (SAP) and the second phase known as the Northern Education Project, which, amongst others, had the direct aim of increasing the number and proportion of girls attending school.

Although girls' enrolment doubled, a large proportion of girls remained out of school and the drop-out rate of girls was significantly higher than that of boys, due to the demands of the household. Moreover, the community schools are generally viewed by education professionals and the public as inferior to other types of schools in the region. However, many parents are willing to send their girls to school under strictly controlled and monitored conditions.

Creating Agents of Positive Change – The Citizens Foundation in Pakistan

Marie Lall, University of London (date?)
<http://www.thecitizensfoundation.org/ePanel/Resources/DownloadFiles/Publications/Category/8/36/Marie%20Lall%20Report.pdf>

The Citizens Foundation (TCF) came into being in 1995 as a group of six friends, all entrepreneurs and Chief Executive Officers (CEOs) of their own companies decided to build five schools in Karachi for the most disadvantaged living in urban slums who had no access to any form of education (public or private) whatsoever. Their desire was to take children off the streets and put them into schools. Out of this evolved the aim to provide quality education for the poor.

The study does not focus on learning outcomes or make comparisons with other school systems. However, the major achievement for TCF as a whole organisation is the establishment of 530 schools in areas which had either no access to education facilities, or where the local government schools were oversubscribed. Today over 60,000 children go to TCF schools (places are in great demand) and the organisation employs 5,310 staff including 3,550 teachers across the central and regional offices.

Do Conditional Cash Transfers Lead to Medium-Term Impacts? Evidence from a Female School Stipend Program in Pakistan

Independent evaluation group, June 24, 2010
[http://lnweb90.worldbank.org/oed/oeddoelib.nsf/DocUNIDViewForJavaSearch/1CE1D20CDD5BBB0985257838004E2C10/\\$file/Conditional%20Cash%20Transfer%20-%20Pakistan%20IE.pdf](http://lnweb90.worldbank.org/oed/oeddoelib.nsf/DocUNIDViewForJavaSearch/1CE1D20CDD5BBB0985257838004E2C10/$file/Conditional%20Cash%20Transfer%20-%20Pakistan%20IE.pdf)

The Punjab Female School Stipend Program (FSSP), a female-targeted conditional cash transfer programme in Pakistan, was implemented in the context of a larger education sector reform and in response to gender gaps in education. Four years into the programme implementation, adolescent girls in stipend districts are more likely to progress through and complete middle school and work less. Although less significant in statistical sense, there is also some suggestive evidence that participant girls delay their marriage by more than a year, and have fewer births by the time they are 19. In addition, girls who are exposed to the

programme later on and eligible for the benefits given in high school also increase their rates of matriculation into and completion of high school grades. There is no evidence that the FSSP has adverse indirect effects on similar educational outcomes of boys living in the same household with eligible girls. Information on learning outcomes (test scores) is available and will be assessed in future research to examine the impacts of the GSP on the academic achievement of girls in the programme.

A second study of this programme focuses on enrolment only...

Conditional cash transfers and female schooling: the impact of the female school stipend programme on public school enrolments in Punjab, Pakistan

Nazmul Chaudhury and Dilip Parajuli, World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No. 4102, 2006

http://www-wds.worldbank.org/servlet/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2006/12/22/000016406_20061222113833/Rendered/PDF/wps4102.pdf

The average programme impact between 2003 and 2005 was an increase of 6 female students per school in terms of absolute change and an increase of 9% in female enrolment in terms of relative change.

6. Additional information

Author

This query response was prepared by **Emma Bell, Independent Consultant**

Contributors

Alan Rogers, Visiting Professor, University of East Anglia

Helen Adadzi, World Bank/FTI (Fast Track Initiative)

Professor Christopher Colclough, Fellow, Corpus Christi College, Cambridge and director of RECOUP RPC

Akanksha Marphatia, Action Aid

Rebecca Winthrop, Senior Fellow and Director, Center for Universal Education, The Brookings Institution

About Helpdesk reports: The HDRC Helpdesk is funded by the DFID Human Development Group. Helpdesk Reports are based on up to 2 days of desk-based research per query and are designed to provide a brief overview of the key issues, and a summary of some of the best literature available. Experts may be contacted during the course of the research, and those able to provide input within the short time-frame are acknowledged.

For any further request or enquiry about consultancy or helpdesk services please contact just-ask@dfidhdc.org

Disclaimer

The DFID Human Development Resource Centre (HDRC) provides technical assistance and information to the British Government's Department for International Development (DFID) and its partners in support of pro-poor programmes in education and health, including nutrition and AIDS. The HDRC services are provided by three organisations: Cambridge Education, HLSP (both part of the Mott MacDonald Group) and the Institute of Development Studies. The views in this report do not necessarily reflect those of DFID or any other contributing organisation.