

## Helpdesk Report: Evidence on outcomes of Skills development/TVET programmes

Date: 12 August 2010

**Query:** What empirical evidence is there that skills development programmes in developing countries have led to marketable skills and resulted in improved employment/self employment outcomes of graduates? In particular, have such programmes reached the poorest and most marginalised, including women?  
The review should consider both recently developed and developing countries.

**Enquirer:** DFID UK

### Content

1. Overview
2. DFID-funded Resources:
  - RECOUP RPC
  - Beyond the Basics Research Project
3. Working Groups
4. Resources from ILO
  - 4.1 Skills for Youth Employment
  - 4.2 Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities
5. Key Documents
  - 5.1 Key Documents
  - 5.2 Case Studies from IDB, Latin America
6. Additional Information

### 1. Overview

#### Overview

Education lifts people out of poverty, but the quality and relevance of that education affect levels of progress. The rates of return to education – the increment of income relating to each year of education – are much higher for those with higher levels of education. There is a large pool of evidence available that aims to analyse the economic benefits, looking at investment versus outcome for rates of return to education. But what evidence is available looking at how skills development programmes have led to marketable skills and better employment rates?

Governments, employers' associations and trade unions around the world are working to improve the quality and relevance of training and employment services in order to improve the employability of workers and the productivity and competitiveness of enterprises. In Europe, there have been criticisms in the UK recently for the mismatch of graduates' skills to the labour market, whereas Germany is well-reputed for linking company and school-based technical and vocational skills training.

There is a lack of empirical data looking at the outcomes of skills development initiatives. Skills development programmes may not necessarily be initially set up to produce the outcome of increased employability, so looking at the evidence of what works needs to be carefully contextualised for feeding into the design of new programmes.

Access for poor and marginalised groups to skills development is a big issue. Initiatives need to target these groups through providing opportunities to enter the informal employment sector as well as the formal economy.

## **2. DFID-funded Resources: RECOUP RPC and Beyond the Basics Research Project**

### **Skills Acquisition and Its Impact upon Lives and Livelihoods**

<http://recoup.educ.cam.ac.uk/research/projects/skills/index.html>

*(several working papers, policy briefs and conference papers available)*

The ways in which the education and training of individuals affect their future lives and livelihoods are the focus of this RECOUP study. Several papers examining the relationships between earnings, education and other individual and household characteristics are being produced, using household surveys and comparable data sets from other countries.

A separate enquiry, using primarily qualitative methods, examines how and under what conditions, the main long- and short-term skills training systems (both public and non-state) contribute to positive labour market outcomes for the poor. It also studies how trainees from poor backgrounds who successfully enter formal or self-employment learn the things that make them succeed.

The main focus of these papers is the rates of return to education – education in general, not skills development programmes – but many of the lessons are applicable.

### **DFID Research project: Beyond the Basics - Education and Poverty**

[www.cas.ed.ac.uk/research\\_projects/beyond\\_basics](http://www.cas.ed.ac.uk/research_projects/beyond_basics)

The Centre of African Studies is carrying out a DFID-funded study on the contribution of post-basic education and training to poverty reduction, in collaboration with researchers in South Africa and India. Several Working Papers and Policy Briefing Papers are available on this page, including country studies

### **Beyond the Basics: Balancing Education and Training Systems in Developing Countries**

*Robert Palmer, Journal for Education in International Development, 2 (1), 2006*

[www.equip123.net/JEID/articles/2/BeyondBasics.pdf](http://www.equip123.net/JEID/articles/2/BeyondBasics.pdf)

As well as support to post-basic education and training, support is also needed to support the labour market environment for economic growth and poverty reduction. Governments need to place a much greater emphasis on what happens when children leave school, by creating supportive measures particularly for the informal economy and ensuring that skills training translates into poverty-reducing employment

### 3. Working Groups

#### **Working Group for International Cooperation in Skills Development**

[www.norrag.org/wg/](http://www.norrag.org/wg/)

This working group aims to increase the impact of development assistance, reduce duplication and fragmentation of effort and provide a forum for the discussion and dissemination of new ideas and good practice. Information focuses on the following themes:

- the conceptual framework of skills development and technical and vocational education and training
- donor and national policies
- experiences in programme support
- project design and implementation
- specific examples of donor cooperation
- approaches to evaluation

Many papers are available to download on these issues: [www.norrag.org/wg/papers.php](http://www.norrag.org/wg/papers.php)

Country studies share knowledge on skills development policies in the South in order to feed the reflection to the international level. Case studies focus on Viet Nam, Peru, Nicaragua and South Africa: [www.norrag.org/wg/country-studies.php](http://www.norrag.org/wg/country-studies.php)

#### **Working Group on SME Policy, Entrepreneurship and Human Capital Development**

[www.oecd.org/pages/0,3417,en\\_34645207\\_34645726\\_1\\_1\\_1\\_1\\_1,00.html](http://www.oecd.org/pages/0,3417,en_34645207_34645726_1_1_1_1_1,00.html)

The key activities of this group are:

- promoting high-growth enterprises
- improving access to finance for SMEs
- supporting enterprise development and business law
- fostering entrepreneurship and bridging the skills gap through human capital development

#### **SDC's Platform for Employment and Income Practitioners**

[www.sdc-employment-income.ch/en/Home/Vocational\\_Skills](http://www.sdc-employment-income.ch/en/Home/Vocational_Skills)

This website hosts documents such as technical articles, reports, discussion summaries, toolkits, showcase projects and links to other actors in the scene under the following main topics: private sector participation, teacher and trainer training, VET systems development and qualifications frameworks.

### 4. Resources from ILO

**These International Labour Organization (ILO) pages link to several other resources, including some regional and country Fact Sheets:**

#### **ILO – Skills Policies and Systems**

[www.ilo.org/skills/areas/lang--en/WCMS\\_DOC\\_SKL ARE SKL EN/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/skills/areas/lang--en/WCMS_DOC_SKL ARE SKL EN/index.htm)

The ILO works with member States to develop frameworks that link skills development to productivity, employment, development and decent work targets, with three main objectives:

- matching training to demand for skills in the labour market
- helping workers and enterprises adjust to technological or market changes
- building and sustaining competencies for future labour market needs, focusing on the strategic role of education and training policies in triggering and continuously fuelling innovation, enterprise development, technological change and competitiveness.

Coordinated efforts are needed to promote skills development at the workplace and along value chains, to help manage the drivers of change at work today, and to integrate skills development into national and sector development strategies.

#### **4.1 ILO-Skills for Youth Employment**

The ILO estimates that some 76 million young women and men were unemployed in 2007, an increase of 14% from 10 years earlier. Young people are almost three times more likely to be unemployed than adults. One in five youth, or 125 million, are working but live in extreme poverty (less than US\$1/day). Skills development is a primary means of enabling young people to make a smooth transition to work. A comprehensive approach is required to integrate young women and men in the labour market, including relevant and quality skills training, labour market information, career guidance and employment services, recognition of prior learning, incorporating entrepreneurship with training and effective skills forecasting.

In many countries, formal Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) is an option for a small minority of young people. Apprenticeships in the informal economy offer many more young people an opportunity to learn a trade and enter the world of work.

#### **Improving Skills and Productivity of Disadvantaged Youth**

ILO Employment Working Paper No. 7, by David H Freedman, 2008

[www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/---ifp\\_skills/documents/publication/wcms\\_103982.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---ifp_skills/documents/publication/wcms_103982.pdf)

The main problem examined in this paper is the insufficiency of formal education and training systems to reach substantial majorities of young people and to prepare them for productive employment. There is an urgent need for alternative, proactive approaches to education and skills development for disadvantaged youth.

This paper focuses attention on the connection between skills development and early labour market success for young people and their ability to realize their long-term potential for productive and gainful work. One of the key findings from this review is that effective policies and programmes address specific sources of disadvantage.

#### **Youth at Risk: The Role of Skills Development in Facilitating the Transition to Work**

ILO EMP/SKILLS Working Paper No. 19, Laura Brewer, 2004

[www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/---ifp\\_skills/documents/publication/wcms\\_103428.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---ifp_skills/documents/publication/wcms_103428.pdf)

This paper seeks to address the issue of skills development for youth-at-risk, including the economically vulnerable and the socially excluded. A micro-level approach is used to identify good examples of training programmes and projects that have successfully identified and targeted vulnerable young women and men and implemented and evaluated their initiatives.

#### **4.2 ILO – Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities**

[www.ilo.org/skills/areas/lang--en/WCMS\\_DOC\\_SKL\\_ARE\\_DBL\\_EN/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/skills/areas/lang--en/WCMS_DOC_SKL_ARE_DBL_EN/index.htm)

One out of every 10 people in the world—or some 650 million people worldwide—has a disability. Approximately 470 million are of working age. While many are successfully employed and fully integrated into society, as a group, persons with disabilities often face disproportionate poverty and unemployment. ILO works to promote skills development and employment opportunities for people with disabilities based on the principles of equal opportunity, equal treatment, mainstreaming into vocational rehabilitation and employment services programmes and community involvement. A strategy of including consideration of persons with disabilities in the training and employment promotion policies and programmes is currently being developed.

#### **Placement of job-seekers with disabilities: elements of an effective service**

ILO, Barbara Murray and Robert Heron, 2003

[www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/documents/publication/wcms\\_bk\\_pb\\_88\\_en.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/documents/publication/wcms_bk_pb_88_en.pdf)

Reviews international trends in the promotion of employment opportunities for people with disabilities and sets out a policy and legislative framework and the key components of placement service.

## 5. Key Documents

### 5.1 Key Documents

#### **World Development Report 2007: Development and the Next Generation**

<http://econ.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/EXTDEC/EXTRESEARCH/EXTWDRS/EXTWDR2007/0,,contentMDK:20601683~pagePK:64167702~piPK:64167676~theSitePK:1489834,00.html>

Developing countries which invest in better education, healthcare, and job training for their record numbers of young people between the ages of 12 and 24 years of age, could produce surging economic growth and sharply reduced poverty. Surveys of young people in East Asia and Eastern Europe and Central Asia - carried out as research for the report - indicate that access to jobs, along with physical security, is their biggest concern. The 2007 WDR frames the human capital development model through three lenses:

- creating opportunities for young people to acquire, improve and deploy their skills
- creating opportunities to build young people's capabilities through providing choices and incentives to make good decisions
- offering second chances that put young people back on the path to build their human capital for the future.

#### **Skills Development for Employability and Citizenship: the Southeast European Experience within a Global Context**

[http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL\\_ID=32510&URL\\_DO=DO\\_TOPIC&URL\\_SECTION=201.html](http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=32510&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html)

For South East European countries, the attainment of skills for employability and citizenship can assist rebuilding communities as well as economies. The challenge is not only to reform their TVET systems, but to do so within the context of overcoming the consequences of conflict and instability which prevailed during the 1990s.

#### **Corporate HRD and Skills Development for Employment: Scope and Strategies**

International Conference in Bali/Indonesia 24-26 November 2008, InWEnt/UNEVOC  
[www.unevoc.unesco.org/fileadmin/user\\_upload/pubs/Corporate\\_HRD\\_and\\_Skills\\_Development\\_for\\_Employment\\_Scope\\_and\\_Strategies.pdf](http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/pubs/Corporate_HRD_and_Skills_Development_for_Employment_Scope_and_Strategies.pdf)

The purpose of the conference was to share national qualifications framework (NQF) models with the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) member countries in order to enhance skills-recognition arrangements across ASEAN and to examine international tendencies in human resource development (HRD) at the workplace.

#### **Linking Vocational Training with the Enterprises: Asian Perspectives**

InWEnt/UNEVOC, 2009

[www.unevoc.unesco.org/up/Link\\_Voc\\_End.pdf](http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/up/Link_Voc_End.pdf)

Coordination mechanisms between TVET and enterprises in different economic sectors are eminently important for the relevance of TVET to both employers and job seekers. Such mechanisms, linkages and "bridges" between training providers and companies cannot follow one uniform design or format under different economic, social and cultural circumstances. In addition, there are a multitude of stakeholders in training, with varying and sometimes conflicting interests, objectives and priorities; and these stakeholders are not the same in every country.

#### **Skills Development to Meet the Learning Needs of the Excluded**

<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0015/001590/159017e.pdf>

David Atchoarena and Miki Nozawa, IIEP, 2004

### **Skills Development in Sub-Saharan Africa**

World Bank Regional and Sectoral Studies, R K Johanson and A V Adams, 2004

<http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/235731/Skills%20Development%20in%20Sub%20Saharan%20Africa.pdf>

This document highlights the importance of understanding the labour market context and developments and of building skills for the informal economy.

### **Skills Development in the Informal Sector of Sub-Saharan Africa**

World Bank, A V Adams, 2008

<http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/251006/day3SkillsfortheInformalApril1Se2.pdf>

Initially viewed as a safety net for those unable to find employment in the modern sector, the image of the informal sector has begun to change with time and the education of those entering it. More workers have begun to view it, not as a temporary stop while searching for employment in the formal wage economy, but as a preferred destination offering opportunities to those wanting to become entrepreneurs.

### **The Role of Youth Skills Development in the Transition to Work: A Global Review**

Arvil V Adams, World Bank, 2007

<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTCY/Resources/395766-1187899515414/RoleofYouthSkills.pdf>

This report examines the role played by skills development in schools and the workplace and its impact on the transition of youth to work in advanced and developing countries. It offers advice to policy makers and development partners on the employment and earnings outcomes associated with different pathways to skills. It highlights what many countries are doing to bridge more effectively schooling and work for youth. Models of technical and vocational education and apprenticeship are reviewed along with programs to provide second chances for youths who may have lacked opportunities to acquire education and training or who initially made bad choices in preparing themselves for the world of work. Choosing effective ways to equip youth with skills is important to investing in them and realizing their potential.

### **International Comparisons of China's TVET System**

UNEVOC, Zhenyi Guo and Stephen Lamb, 2010

[www.unevoc.unesco.org/2.0.html?&tx\\_drwiki\\_pi1\[keyword\]=International Comparisons of Chinese TVET System \(Book Series 12\)](http://www.unevoc.unesco.org/2.0.html?&tx_drwiki_pi1[keyword]=International%20Comparisons%20of%20Chinese%20TVET%20System%20(Book%20Series%2012)) *[book not available online]*

Is China's TVET system adapting to the rapidly evolving needs of its industry? Using the province of Yunnan as a subject, this case study analyses the operation of TVET in China. The authors deployed a set of internationally comparable criteria to assess current performance, at the same time documenting areas of strength and weakness. They discover that in Yunnan, a province representative of the challenges faced nationwide, an overhaul of programmes aims to make them relevant to industry requirements, alongside a major investment in infrastructure.

### **Gender and Skills Development: A Practical Tool to Mainstream Gender Equality into Skills Development Projects for Better Employment Opportunities**

Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation, 2006

[www.deza.admin.ch/en/Home/Themes/Employment\\_and\\_the\\_economy/Vocational\\_skills\\_development/Gender\\_and\\_vocational\\_skills\\_development](http://www.deza.admin.ch/en/Home/Themes/Employment_and_the_economy/Vocational_skills_development/Gender_and_vocational_skills_development)

This tool is intended to facilitate context assessment in terms of gender inequalities. It can be used to assess behavioural changes caused by skills-development projects and their impact in terms of access to employment.

### **GTZ Developing Skills to Enhance Employment in South Africa: Programme Description**

[www.gtz.de/en/weltweit/afrika/suedafrika/24658.htm](http://www.gtz.de/en/weltweit/afrika/suedafrika/24658.htm)

Figures from independent surveys in the construction and metal industries confirm a positive picture with approximately 76 percent (construction industry) and 67 percent (metal industry) of the graduates finding employment after their training.

## 5.2 Case Studies from IDB, Latin America

### **Hire for Attitude, Train for Skills: Case Study on the Transition from School to Work in Latin America**

[www.iadb.org/topics/education/educationandtheidb/index.cfm?language=En&artID=7464](http://www.iadb.org/topics/education/educationandtheidb/index.cfm?language=En&artID=7464)

#### **The IDB and Job Creation. Report to the Summit of the Americas**

Gustavo Márquez, Jacqueline Mazza, Angela Paris, Laura Ripani, Inter-American Development Bank

<http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getdocument.aspx?docnum=1481963>

Creating jobs is one of the key development challenges facing Latin America and the Caribbean and one of the region's foremost needs. Job creation cannot be achieved by relying on a single public policy or programme. This publication focuses on the business climate, investment and labour market policies and programmes, examining regional trends. Employment growth requires attention to the macroeconomic stability and complementary social and fiscal policies.

#### **Training Quality and Earnings: The Effects of Competition on the Provision of Public-Sponsored Training Programs**

Alberto E Chong and José Galdo, Inter-American Development Bank

<http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getdocument.aspx?docnum=844833>

This paper evaluates the effectiveness of market-based approaches in the provision of public-sponsored training programmes. In particular, the study highlights the training quality and labour earnings from a Peruvian programme targeting disadvantaged youths. The earning differentials are larger for females than males, and are larger in the medium term rather than short run.

#### **The Impact of Public and Private Job Training in Colombia**

Carlos Medina and Jairo Nuñez, Inter-American Development Bank

<http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getdocument.aspx?docnum=539426>

The authors present various matching estimators of the impact on earnings for individuals who attended public and private job training programmes in Colombia. Key findings include:

- For youths, no institution has a significant impact in the short or long run except private institutions for males.
- For adult females trained through the main government programme, there are positive, but not significant, impacts in the short run and greater effects in the long run. All other public institutions have a higher impact that is significant in the long run.
- For adults trained at private institutions there are large and significant effects in both the short and long run, but for adult males in the short run the effects are smaller and only barely significant.

Neither short nor long courses run by the main government programme seem to have significant impact on their graduates' earnings. In general, females benefit more from both kinds of courses than males, particularly from long courses.

#### **Educating out of Poverty? A Synthesis Report on Ghana, India, Kenya, Rwanda, Tanzania and South Africa.**

Palmer, R., Wedgwood, R. & Hayman, R. (2007). DfID, page 99.

[www.research4development.info/PDF/Outputs/PolicyStrategy/ResearchingtheIssuesNo70.pdf](http://www.research4development.info/PDF/Outputs/PolicyStrategy/ResearchingtheIssuesNo70.pdf)

#### **Skills and Productivity in the Informal Economy,**

Robert Palmer, 2008, ILO

[www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/download/wpaper/wp5.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/download/wpaper/wp5.pdf)

### **Skills Development**

[www.skillsdevelopment.org/pdf/Skills%20Development%20&%20Poverty%20Reduction.pdf](http://www.skillsdevelopment.org/pdf/Skills%20Development%20&%20Poverty%20Reduction.pdf)

### **Training for Rural Development: Literature Review**

[http://t4rd.skillsdevelopment.org/pdf/Rural\\_Research\\_lit\\_review\\_dec2009.pdf](http://t4rd.skillsdevelopment.org/pdf/Rural_Research_lit_review_dec2009.pdf)

This article covers the evidence on the impact of agricultural training.

“Isolating the impact of training is challenging; the effect of extension on productivity depends heavily on the broader environment and interacts with other factors such as prior education levels, the availability of capital to fund changes in production methods and rural infrastructure.<sup>4</sup> Evenson’s (2002) review of the growing body of literature nevertheless found that the majority of extension impact studies showed a statistically significant correlation between extension and yield, controlling for factors such as labour, water and fertiliser (see for example Feder et al., 1985; Peraton et al., 1985; Jamieson and Mook, 1984; Evenson and Bravo-Ureta, 1994). After addressing a number of criticisms of impact studies, Evenson argued that the studies conducted up to the point of review supported the theory that extension programmes have the potential to make a large development impact, and suggested that: ‘the evidence for economic impacts of research and extension programmes is probably more complete and comprehensive than the evidence for many other development programmes’ (ibid: 41).”

CSD’s **Training for Rural Development: Review of Practice** draws together impact assessments and academic overviews on agriculture and enterprise projects which target rural women.

<http://t4rd.skillsdevelopment.org/pdf/Review%20of%20Practice.pdf>

Danida’s **Farm Women in Development** is an impact study of 4 training projects in India that focused on training women to improve their agricultural production

[www.um.dk/Publikationer/Danida/English/Evaluations/FarmWomenInDevelopmentIndia/ReportIndia.pdf](http://www.um.dk/Publikationer/Danida/English/Evaluations/FarmWomenInDevelopmentIndia/ReportIndia.pdf)

CSD also has a briefing note on **Skills for Agriculture**

[www.skillsdevelopment.org/pdf/Skills%20for%20Agriculture.pdf](http://www.skillsdevelopment.org/pdf/Skills%20for%20Agriculture.pdf)

and the full report, which builds on multiple evaluations, and is available at:

<http://t4rd.skillsdevelopment.org/pdf/Training%20for%20rural%20development.pdf>

### **Enterprise skills development & the informal sector**

ILO’s **Start your own Business Project** in Vietnam evaluates a project which provided business and marketing training to women [www.oit.org/wcmstp5/groups/public/---ed\\_emp/---emp\\_ent/documents/publication/wcms\\_113777.pdf](http://www.oit.org/wcmstp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_ent/documents/publication/wcms_113777.pdf)

### **The Impact of Training on Women’s Micro Enterprise Development, DFID**

<http://ageconsearch.umn.edu/bitstream/12862/1/er010040.pdf>

### **General vocational education and training**

#### **Effectiveness of Lending for Vocational Education and Training: Lessons from World Bank Experience**

World Bank Social Protection Discussion Paper Series No. 0222, by S Canagarajah, A Dar, R Nording and D Raju

<http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/243580/defectiveness%20of%20lending%20for%20VET.pdf>

This paper brought out a number of guidelines for projects in the VET sector, which are summarised below:

In the context of assistance for VET programmes, the work carried out by the World Bank in 2002 to evaluate its own programmes in the area of vocational education and training highlights several points.

- Project justification needs to be based on **sound macro-economic analysis**, including examining questions of medium-term skill needs and the impact of training reform on labour market efficiency and the economy as a whole – whether at a national, regional or local level. This point is also emphasised by Alam’s analysis of Bangladesh, which argues that the most beneficial VET programme for the country would be one that offered students broad vocational training across a limited number of sectors of particular economic importance for the country, with the opportunity to specialise later on (Alam, G.M., 2008. *The role of technical and vocational education in the national development of Bangladesh*. Asia-Pacific Journal of Cooperative Education 9(1), 25-44).
- Project management and financial responsibility was found to be best **devolved to training institutions** with appropriate mechanisms to ensure accountability within an overarching coordination framework. This was found to improve responsiveness to labour market needs, cost-effectiveness of training provision and flexibility of project activity execution.
- Measures to **encourage private training providers** can help develop a more demand-driven and cost-effective training system. The World Bank found that when project succeeded in building close links between employers and the training system, this improved the cost-effectiveness and relevance of the training provided.
- Regular **stakeholder engagement and consultation** is key to ensure a sense of ownership and commitment and to increase the likelihood of project sustainability.
- **Funding for training** as a form of targeted financial assistance to employers and training institutions can help increase flexibility in responding to periodic training needs. Creating such funds requires a strong administrative structure, agreement among policymakers on the rationale, purpose and benefits of the fund, and management and financial autonomy in operation of the fund. Since the number of primary graduates in the developing world has increased significantly in recent years, driving higher demand for secondary and vocational education, strong funding mechanisms will be necessary if prohibitive fees are to be avoided (Singh, M., 2008, **School enterprises and sustainability: challenges for secondary and vocational education**. Presentation to the Biennale on Education in Africa, Maputo, p.7 <http://www.adeanet.org/adeaPortal/adea/Biennale%202008/Documentation/Papers%20for%20presentation/06.%20Session%206/Parallel%20session%206B/Final%20PDF%20documents/Session%206B%20Doc%204%20UNESCO%20UIL%20ENG.pdf>).
- Specific consideration needs to be given to **training for the informal sector**. World Bank experience in this area is mixed and it is not clear that interventions in this area have always been cost-effective or sustainable. Clear definition of training requirement by employers is needed, along with concerted efforts at outreach, but this is made more difficult by the diverse nature of the informal sector target group. Despite these difficulties, CSD believes that the size and importance of the informal sector in many developing countries means it should not be ignored, and there is scope for more detailed research into how this sector can be more effectively targeted. This point is emphasised by Palmer (2008), who argues that “developing countries need to have a national skills development strategy that pays due attention to the informal economy, and is operationalised through strong coordination between government ministries, departments and agencies, public and private providers and Informal Sector Associations (and unions). Coordinating councils must be vested with real authority and employers must be strongly represented in such bodies” ([www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/download/wpaper/wp5.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/download/wpaper/wp5.pdf)). Such skills development strategies also need to recognise the very different characteristics of the various groups categorised under the heading “informal economy”, and target skills training accordingly.
- To ensure that policy makers can assess the effectiveness of programmes, **monitoring and evaluation** instruments are key. The World Bank found that poor monitoring and evaluation had been a problem for almost all their projects in the VET sector.

## **A Review of Interventions to Support Young Workers: Findings of the Youth Employment Inventory**

Social Protection Discussion Paper No. 0715, 2007

<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/SP-Discussion-papers/Labor-Market-DP/0715.pdf>

## **Evaluating the Impact of Job Training Programmes in Latin America: Evidence from IDB Funded Operations**

*Journal of Development Effectiveness*, 1(2): 195-216, Ibararán, P. and D. Rosas, 2010

**India** –India’s National Rural Employment Guarantee (NREG) program guarantees 100 days of employment to all rural households on demand at the state minimum wage. The impact evaluation (IE) is examining direct channels (cash transfer benefits to participating households) and indirect channels (impacts on wage rates in local labor markets), through which the program operates; its impact on employment and earnings, general poverty reduction, and impact differences by gender. [www.nrega.net/](http://www.nrega.net/)

**Jamaica** – The Steps to Work program provides *new* counseling and referral services to working-age adults in households receiving conditional cash transfers through the Program of Advancement through Health and Education (PATH). The program aims to promote participants’ uptake of *existing* employment-related social services, with the goal of increasing their employability, their employment rate and their earnings. The IE is considering whether making the counseling program made accessible to PATH recipients increases labor uptake and earnings, and whether the labor market programs that Steps to Work participants take part in influence employment outcomes.

**Dominican Republic** – The DR Youth Development Program (YDP) is promoting skills development and employment for at-risk youth using classroom-based training and private-sector firm internships. The IE is analyzing whether the YDP increases youth employment; improves participants’ cognitive abilities; improves the quality of youth employment; and/or reduces risky behavior such as alcohol consumption, drug and tobacco use, commercial sex, unprotected sex, gang participation and/or criminal behavior. <http://web.worldbank.org/external/projects/main?pagePK=64283627&piPK=73230&theSitePK=40941&menuPK=228424&Projectid=P096605>

**Honduras** –*Mi Primer Empleo* promotes employment of poor urban youth who have abandoned the conventional education system and who are unemployed or underemployed through life skills and job trainings, and internships. The IE is evaluating whether participation in *Mi Primer Empleo* improves labor market outcomes and whether the program decreases participation in risky youth behaviors.

[http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTLM/Resources/390041-1141141801867/2275364-1242414430780/Concept\\_Note-Honduras\\_05-23-07.pdf](http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTLM/Resources/390041-1141141801867/2275364-1242414430780/Concept_Note-Honduras_05-23-07.pdf)

**Uganda** – The Youth Opportunities Program (YOP) trains unemployed youth in vocational skills of their choice. The IE is studying the impact of YOP participation on youth employment, educational attainment, leadership development, psychosocial wellbeing, health, and risky behaviors. [http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/280558-1138289492561/2158434-1228317850075/5637583-1228317993563/Martinez-NUSAF\\_YOP\\_IE\\_v1.pdf](http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/280558-1138289492561/2158434-1228317850075/5637583-1228317993563/Martinez-NUSAF_YOP_IE_v1.pdf)

## **Education and Skills: Strategies for Accelerated Development in Asia and the Pacific**

Asian Development Bank, 2008

[www.adb.org/Documents/Studies/Education-Skills-Strategies-Development/Education-Skills-Strategies-Development.pdf](http://www.adb.org/Documents/Studies/Education-Skills-Strategies-Development/Education-Skills-Strategies-Development.pdf)

**Boosting Jobs and Incomes: Policy Lessons from Reassessing the OECD Jobs Strategy**

OECD, 2006

[www.oecd.org/dataoecd/47/53/36889821.pdf](http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/47/53/36889821.pdf)

**Skills for Work, Growth and Poverty Reduction: Challenges and Opportunities in the Global Analysis and Monitoring of Skills**

Kenneth King and Robert Palmer, UK National Commission for UNESCO, September 2008

[www.unesco.org.uk/uploads/SkillsforWorkGrowthandPovertyReduction-Sept08.pdf](http://www.unesco.org.uk/uploads/SkillsforWorkGrowthandPovertyReduction-Sept08.pdf)

**Technical and Vocational Skills Development**

DFID Practice Paper, April 2007

**Skills Development in Sub-Saharan Africa**

<http://info.worldbank.org/etools/docs/library/235731/Skills%20Development%20in%20Sub%20Saharan%20Africa.pdf>

**Using Distance Education for Skills Development**

DFID Researching the Issues Series 62, Raheena Raza and Terry Allsop, 2006

[www.research4development.info/PDF/Outputs/SkillsForDev/EducationalPaperNo62.pdf](http://www.research4development.info/PDF/Outputs/SkillsForDev/EducationalPaperNo62.pdf)

**Educating out of Poverty? A Synthesis Report on Ghana, India, Kenya, Rwanda, Tanzania and South Africa**

DFID Researching the Issues Series 70, by Robert Palmer, Ruth Wedgwood and Rachel Hayman with Kenneth King and Neil Thin

[www.research4development.info/PDF/Outputs/PolicyStrategy/ResearchingtheIssuesNo70.pdf](http://www.research4development.info/PDF/Outputs/PolicyStrategy/ResearchingtheIssuesNo70.pdf)

**Education, Training and Labour Market Outcomes in Ghana: A Review of the Evidence**

RECOUP Working Paper 9, Robert Palmer, 2007

<http://recoup.educ.cam.ac.uk/publications/WP9-RP.pdf>

This literature review synthesizes what is known about the relationships between education, training and the labour market in Ghana. It focuses upon the returns to education and training in both formal and informal sectors of the economy. Characteristics of the broader labour market environment in Ghana, and of pathways from education and skills training to employment, are identified.

**Skill acquisition and its impact upon lives and livelihoods in Ghana, India, and Pakistan**

[forthcoming]

The poorest and most disadvantaged young people, who were the focus of this study, found it hard to access formal TVET courses or often even the informal apprenticeships. For those accessing formal and informal TVET, putting their training into practice was far from straightforward.

**6. Additional information**

**Author**

This query response was prepared by **Sandra Baxter** [S.Baxter@ids.ac.uk](mailto:S.Baxter@ids.ac.uk)

**Contributors**

David Atchoarena, UNESCO

Peter Atherton, Institute of Education

Chris Colclough, University of Cambridge

Kathleen Collett, City & Guilds Centre for Skills Development  
Kenneth King, University of Edinburgh  
David Levesque, DFID  
Jee-Peng Tan, World Bank Human Development Network

**About Helpdesk reports:** The HDRC Helpdesk is funded by the DFID Human Development Group. Helpdesk Reports are based on up to 2 days of desk-based research per query and are designed to provide a brief overview of the key issues, and a summary of some of the best literature available. Experts may be contacted during the course of the research, and those able to provide input within the short time-frame are acknowledged.

For any further request or enquiry about consultancy or helpdesk services please contact [just-ask@dfidhdc.org](mailto:just-ask@dfidhdc.org)

**Disclaimer**

*The DFID Human Development Resource Centre (HDRC) provides technical assistance and information to the British Government's Department for International Development (DFID) and its partners in support of pro-poor programmes in education and health, including nutrition and AIDS. The HDRC services are provided by three organisations: Cambridge Education, HLSP (both part of the Mott MacDonald Group) and the Institute of Development Studies. The views in this report do not necessarily reflect those of DFID or any other contributing organisation.*